

MINUTES

PLANNING COMMISSION MEETING

OCTOBER 24, 2005

The meeting of the El Cajon City Planning Commission is called to order at 7:00 PM.

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

COMMISSIONERS PRESENT: WELLS, WOODS, AMBROSE, BLACK, TURNER-EMERSON

COMMISSIONERS ABSENT: NONE

OTHERS PRESENT: RAMIREZ, Principal Planner
FOSTER, Assistant City Attorney
DAVIES, Principal Civil Engineer
ALVEY, Associate Planner
CRAIG, Assistant Planner
HAWLEY, Administrative Secretary

MINUTES OF 10/10/05

Motion by AMBROSE, second by WOODS, to approve the Minutes of October 10, 2005 pro forma; carries 4-0 (TURNER-EMERSON – Abstained)

TURNER-EMERSON explains the mission of the Planning Commission and the proper procedure for speaking before the Commission and asks for proper decorum during the meeting.

PLANNED UNIT DEVELOPMENT 292 & Tentative Subdivision Map 606 – Westone Management Consultants for Pars Group LLC

(continued public hearings) Continued to 11/21/05
(joint noticed CC mtg 10-25-05)
(P.C. mtg. 10/24/05)

The subject property is located on the south side of E. Washington Avenue between Dorothy Street and Jamacha Road, and addressed as 1371 E. Washington Avenue; APN: 514-012-34; General Plan Designation: Medium Density Residential

Request to convert an existing 10-unit apartment complex into a common interest development and to create a one-lot subdivision map in the R-3-R (Multiple Family Restricted) zone. ***Continued from the meeting of September 26, 2005.***

ALVEY provides a summary of the staff report, indicating that the applicant has requested a 30-day continuance of the public hearings. Staff recommends that the Planning Commission continue the public hearings for Planned Unit Development 292 and Tentative Subdivision Map 606 to the meeting of November 21, 2005, with the applicant to pay the cost of re-noticing.

The public hearings are still open.

Joseph SCARLATTI, Westone Management Consultants, 8799 Balboa Avenue, Suite 240, San Diego, CA, confirms their request for a continuance.

No one else comes forward to be heard.

Motion by WOODS, second by WELLS, to CONTINUE the public hearings on Planned Unit Development 292 and Tentative Subdivision Map 606 to the meeting of November 21, 2005, with the applicant to pay the cost for re-noticing; carries 5-0.

CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT 2012 - Whillock
(continued public hearing) Resolution No. 10208
(P.C. mtg. 10/24/05)

The subject property is located on the west side of Front St. between Palm Ave. and W. Main St. and addressed as 330-346 Front Street; APN: 487-271-08 & -11; General Plan Designation: Special Development Area #11.

Request to utilize prefabricated structures for storage purposes in the M (Manufacturing) zone. ***Continued from the meeting of September 26, 2005.***

ALVEY discusses the history of the request and the Zoning Ordinance violations that have occurred at the subject property. He outlines steps the applicant has taken to address the violations, and informs it is staff's opinion that the use of the subject property for outdoor storage and metal containers was not legally established, and must conform to current Zoning Ordinance regulations. Staff recommends that the Planning Commission grant Conditional Use Permit 2012 subject to the conditions and for the reasons stated in the staff report.

The public hearing is still open.

Mark WHILLOCK, 346 Front Street, El Cajon, CA, is the applicant. He requests his representative come forward to speak.

Scott TALLMAN, 15447 Lawson Valley Road, Jamul, CA, speaks on behalf of the applicant and in support of the item. He indicates they are in agreement with some of the recommendations by staff, but feels a conditional use permit is not required. He submits a handout documenting similar projects and uses in the City, along with a parcel map, building permits and Police Department recommendations for the proposed project.

TALLMAN states that most of staff's concerns have been addressed. The remaining items being disputed are: method for mounting temporary storage containers; westerly parcel is not landlocked, in their opinion and does not warrant consolidation with the easterly parcel; Police Dept. recommendation for an unobstructed view through the security fencing.

In response to the question by TURNER-EMERSON, ALVEY notes that the projects for the school district's facilities do not fall within the purview of the City for building permit issuance. Regarding the requirement for view-obscuring fencing, staff is seeking compliance with the Zoning Ordinance standards for an industrially zoned property. As an alternative, the applicant may use chain link fencing without screening for security purposes, and construct a building to house stored items.

Mark WHILLOCK, 346 Front Street, El Cajon, CA, returns to the podium. He speaks about problems with theft and vandalism at the subject site, and indicates they have kept the alley clean, as well as the areas around the sheds and buildings. WHILLOCK disagrees with staff's statement that he did not correct violations identified in staff's letter dated October, 2003.

No one else comes forward to be heard.

Motion by BLACK, second by WELLS, to close the public hearing; carries 5-0.

A discussion ensues among Commissioners and staff concerning:

- Lot consolidations and certificates of compliance
- Zoning Ordinance requirements for view obscuring fencing and the inability of the Planning Commission to waive such requirements
- The option for the applicant to appeal the Planning Commission decision to the City Council

Motion by WELLS, second by WOODS, to GRANT Conditional Use Permit 2012 in accordance with the staff report; carries 5-0.

PLANNED UNIT DEVELOPMENT 289 – Watson for WGA East Main Street, LP

(continued public hearing) Resolution No. 10211

(joint noticed CC mtg. 11-8-05)

(P.C. mtg. 10/24/05)

The subject property is located on the north side of E. Main Street between N. Second and E. Madison Avenues – addressed as 1362 East Main Street; APN: 489-180-26; General Plan Designation: Medium Density Residential/General Retail Commercial.

Request to convert an existing 68-unit apartment complex into a common interest development in the R-3 (Multiple-Family) and the R-4 (Multiple-Family, High Density) zones. ***Continued from the Planning Commission meetings of Sept. 12 and October 10, 2005.***

AND

TENTATIVE SUBDIVISION MAP 602 - Watson for WGA East Main Street, LP

(continued public hearing) Resolution No. 10212

(joint noticed CC mtg. 11-8-05)

(P.C. mtg. 10/24/05)

Request a one-lot subdivision map in the R-3 (Multiple-Family) and R-4 (Multiple-Family, High Density) zones. ***Continued from the Planning Commission meetings of Sept. 12 and October 10, 2005.***

RAMIREZ provides a summary of the staff reports. She notes that staff expressed the need for more detail in the proposed elevations to improve the existing motel appearance, and that the common area plan should depict how this area fits in with the rest of the development. Staff is satisfied that the revised submittals adequately address the concerns.

RAMIREZ states the items were jointly noticed for a City Council public hearing on November 8, 2005. Staff is recommending that the Planning Commission recommend approval of Planned Unit Development 289 and Tentative Subdivision Map 602 subject to conditions and for the reasons stated in the staff reports.

The public hearings are still open.

Christina WATSON, 9252 Chesapeake Drive, San Diego, CA, is the applicant's representative. She speaks about the changes made in the revised elevations and the new common area plan.

Andrea ANDERSON, 1362 East Main Street, El Cajon, CA, speaks about the water stains at the subject property and expresses concerns about displacement of residents.

A discussion ensues among Commissioners, staff and the speaker concerning the estimated timeframe for completion of the project.

No one else comes forward to be heard.

Motion by WOODS, second by BLACK, to close the public hearing; carries 5-0.

Motion by BLACK, second by WOODS, to RECOMMEND APPROVAL of Planned Unit Development 289 in accordance with the staff report; carries 5-0.

Motion by BLACK, second by WOODS, to RECOMMEND APPROVAL of Tentative Subdivision Map 602 in accordance with the staff report; carries 5-0.

AMBROSE advises that his company has a contract with the applicant, and he will need to abstain from Agenda Items 4A and 4B. He leaves the Council chambers.

PLANNED UNIT DEVELOPMENT 293 – CondoConversions.com for Scheidel

(continued public hearings) Continued to 12/12/05

(joint noticed CC mtg. 11-8-05)

(P.C. mtg. 10/24/05)

The subject property is located on the east side of Emerald Avenue between W. Washington and Chamberlain Avenues, and addressed as 661 – 675 Emerald Avenue; APN: 487-543-22; General Plan Designation: Medium Density Residential.

Request to convert an existing 18-unit apartment complex into a common interest development in the R-3 (Multiple Family) zone. ***Continued from the meeting of October 10, 2005.***

AND

TENTATIVE SUBDIVISION MAP 607 - CondoConversions.com for Scheidel

(continued public hearings) Continued to 12/12/05

(joint noticed CC mtg. 11-8-05)

(P.C. mtg. 10/24/05)

Request a one-lot subdivision map in the R-3 (Multiple Family) zone. ***Continued from the meeting of October 10, 2005.***

ALVEY provides a summary of the staff reports and the history of the continued public hearings. He discusses the new site design and the common area amenities proposed by the applicant. Staff suggests locating the pool equipment and restrooms so that a buffer is provided from the street, and to facilitate greater privacy for residents.

ALVEY states the applicant has taken positive steps towards eliminating the motel design of the existing buildings, but further re-design is warranted. Enhanced exterior elevations have not been submitted for all sides of all buildings, nor have elevations been submitted for the proposed pool equipment and restroom building. Staff's preference is to work with the applicant and reschedule the items for review by the Planning Commission once the proposal has been modified. As currently proposed, staff recommends that the Planning Commission deny Planned Unit Development 293 and Tentative Subdivision Map 607.

The public hearings are still open.

Chris CHRISTENSEN, CondoConversions.com, 4817 Palm Avenue, Suite I, La Mesa, CA, is the applicant's representative. He indicates revised elevations, addressing all of staff's concerns, were submitted in a timely fashion, and he discusses proposed common area amenities and upgrades to the exterior of buildings. They are not willing to accept denial of the project and do not wish to request withdrawal of the applications. Their preference is for a continuance of the items.

A discussion ensues among Commissioners, staff and the speaker concerning:

- The disadvantages of a short turnaround time for continuances
- The options to withdraw, deny or continue the items

No one else comes forward to be heard.

Motion by WOODS, second by WELLS, to CONTINUE the public hearing on Planned Unit Development 293 to the meeting of December 12, 2005; carries 4-0 (AMBROSE – abstained).

Motion by WOODS, second by WELLS, to CONTINUE the public hearing on Tentative Subdivision Map 607 to the meeting of December 12, 2005; carries 4-0 (AMBROSE – abstained).

AMBROSE returns to the Council chambers.

PLANNED UNIT DEVELOPMENT 294 – Ferson for BGA, Ltd.

(continued public hearing) Resolution No. 10218

(joint noticed CC mtg. 11-8-05)

(P.C. mtg. 10/24/05)

The subject property is located on the south side of Broadway between Grape and Third Streets, and addressed as 1499 Broadway; APN: 507-281-57; General Plan Designation: Medium Density Residential.

Request to convert a 16-unit apartment complex into a common interest development in the R-3 (Multiple Family) zone. ***Continued from the meeting of October 10, 2005.***

AND

TENTATIVE SUBDIVISION MAP 608 - Ferson for BGA, Ltd.

(continued public hearing) Resolution No. 10219
(joint noticed CC mtg. 11-8-05)
(P.C. mtg. 10/24/05)

Request a one-lot subdivision map in the R-3 (Multiple Family) zone. ***Continued from the meeting of October 10, 2005.***

ALVEY gives an overview of the project, indicating that the items were continued from the October 10, 2005 meeting to provide time for the applicant to resolve issues associated with an illegal dwelling unit at the subject site. Since that time, written confirmation has been provided regarding relocation of the illegal dwelling unit; a building permit has been obtained to remove the items that were illegally installed within the unit; and staff has been provided with a written narrative which details the proposed use of the illegal dwelling. Staff is ready to move forward with this request, and recommends that the Planning Commission recommend approval of Planned Unit Development 294 and Tentative Subdivision Map 608 subject to the conditions and for the reasons as stated in the staff reports.

The public hearings are still open.

Dan FERSON, 9404 Genesee Avenue, Suite 200, San Diego, CA, is the applicant. He speaks in favor of the project and requests a waiver of condition 6.a.5 concerning installation of a masonry wall, as they would like to construct carports, with storage compartments. This would create a barrier between the buildings and the parking area. Waiver is also requested for Public Works condition #2 requiring reconstruction of a curb return.

Discussion ensues among Commissioners and staff concerning:

- The suggestion to install carports in lieu of a masonry wall
- The required 35-foot curb return radius for major thoroughfares

Steven RODICK, Condominium Consultants, Inc., 7777 Alvarado Road, Suite 615, La Mesa, CA, is the applicant's representative. He cites City Council Policy C-7, and expresses concerns about the financial burden to the applicant associated with the Public Works requirement for relocation of the traffic signal.

Discussion ensues among Commissioners, staff and the speaker concerning:

- Authority to waive or modify Public Works Department requirements
- The color scheme for the exterior doors, window trim and French doors (“fired brick” red, in particular)

No one else comes forward to be heard.

Motion by AMBROSE, second by BLACK, to close the public hearing; carries 5-0.

Commissioners and staff further discuss:

- The proposal to install carports
- Possible waiver of the requirement to relocate the traffic signal at the sole cost of the applicant

Motion by AMBROSE, second by BLACK, to RECOMMEND APPROVAL of Planned Unit Development 294, rewording condition 5.b to read: “Indicate the location of a masonry wall separating the parking area and dwelling units, or the location of carports including storage areas that will shield the dwellings from parking area noise and light;” and adding to condition 6.a)5., as follows: “(As an option, the applicant may construct carports; refer to condition 6.b)16.); and adding a new condition 6.b)16., to read, “As an option to the masonry wall referenced in condition 6.a) 5., the applicant may install carports, provided that they include storage areas that will shield the dwellings from parking area noise and light, and provided that the carport design and materials which complement the approved elevations.”, carries 5-0.

Motion by AMBROSE, second by BLACK, to RECOMMEND APPROVAL of Tentative Subdivision Map 608 in accordance with the staff report; carries 5-0.

PLANNED UNIT DEVELOPMENT 295 – Anthony-Taylor Consultants for Brighton Homes LLC

(public hearing) Resolution No. 10220
(joint noticed CC mtg 11-29-05)
(P.C. mtg. 10/24/05)

The subject property is located on the east side of Orlando St. between East Main St. and E. Madison Ave., and addressed as 203 Orlando St; APN: 489-161-10; General Plan Designation: Medium Density Residential.

Request to construct a four-unit common interest residential development in the R-3 (Multiple Family) zone.

AND

TENTATIVE SUBDIVISION MAP 609 - Anthony-Taylor Consultants for Brighton Homes LLC

(public hearing) Resolution No. 10221
(joint noticed CC mtg 11-29-05)
(P.C. mtg. 10/24/05)

Request a one-lot subdivision map in the R-3 (Multiple Family) zone.

CRAIG provides a summary of the project, indicating the applicant's proposal meets all Zoning Ordinance requirements with the exception of the proposed trash enclosure. Staff proposes a condition of approval requiring a re-design of the trash enclosure to comply with City standards. Staff also recommends architectural enhancements including an exterior treatment, such as ledge rock or river rock, to the base and corners of the proposed building, and a pitched roof for the east and west ends of the building. Staff recommends the Planning Commission recommend approval of Planned Unit Development 295 and Tentative Subdivision Map 609 subject to the conditions listed in the staff reports.

CRAIG advises that comments were received this afternoon from an adjacent property owner [WATKINS] with concerns about storm water drainage from an adjacent property possibly being blocked by the proposed development. This new information has been distributed to Planning Commissioners.

TURNER-EMERSON opens the public hearings.

Lindsay ERICKSON, Anthony-Taylor Consultants, 304 Enterprise St., Escondido, CA, is the applicant's representative. She indicates they agree with the terms and conditions stated in the staff report, and they are willing to work with staff to add a stone facade or other recommended treatments as recommended by staff.

AMBROSE suggests adding more windows to the exterior elevations facing the parking lot.

Shirley WATKINS, 707 South Park Place, El Cajon, CA, represents the Shady Lane Trailer Park. She expresses concern about drainage from a neighboring property which she owns possibly being blocked by the proposed development on the subject property.

In response to the question by TURNER-EMERSON, DAVIES states that California drainage law prohibits blockage of the natural flow of drainage. Public Works condition #13 requires that a drainage study be completed for the proposed project. DAVIES advises that the Public Works Department will follow up on the concerns raised by the speaker.

No one else comes forward to be heard.

Motion by WELLS, second by BLACK, to close the public hearing; carries 5-0.

Motion by WELLS, second by WOODS, to RECOMMEND APPROVAL of Planned Unit

Development 295, modifying condition 2 to read: “The applicant shall provide additional windows on the east and west building elevations, and additional architectural enhancements throughout the project (especially on the east and west elevations), to the satisfaction of the Director of Community Development. Said enhancements shall be reflected in the construction drawings submitted for building permits.” carries 5-0.

Motion by WELLS, second by WOODS, to RECOMMEND APPROVAL of Tentative Subdivision Map 609 in accordance with the staff report; carries 5-0.

PLANNED UNIT DEVELOPMENT 296 – Rodick for Lang

(public hearing) Resolution No. 10222
(joint noticed CC mtg 11-29-05)
(P.C. mtg. 10/24/05)

The subject property is located on the south side of Broadway between Second and Grape Streets, and addressed as 1365 Broadway; APN: 484-261-80; General Plan Designation: Medium Density Residential.

Request to convert an existing 36-unit apartment complex into a common interest development in the R-3 (Multiple Family) zone.

AND

TENTATIVE SUBDIVISION MAP 610 – Rodick for Lang

(public hearing) Resolution No. 10223
(joint noticed CC mtg 11-29-05)
(P.C. mtg. 10/24/05)

Request a one-lot subdivision in the R-3 (Multiple Family) zone.

RAMIREZ provides a summary of the project. She discusses the proposed enhanced exterior elevations, which lack detail and do little to change the appearance of the existing apartment complex. RAMIREZ states the applicant should be aware that the Planning Commission acceptance of the elevations as presented, does not guarantee City Council approval of the same.

RAMIREZ indicates these items were jointly noticed for the City Council’s November 29th public hearing. Staff is recommending that the Planning Commission recommend approval of Planned Unit Development 296 and Tentative Subdivision Map 610, subject to conditions and for the reasons stated in the staff reports.

Discussion ensues among Commissioners and staff concerning design challenges and the scope of enhancements observed with other condominium conversion projects.

TURNER-EMERSON opens the public hearings.

Randy LANG, 9160 Gramercy Drive, San Diego, CA, is the applicant. He addresses concerns from several residents with regard to loss of privacy, and requests to use solid wood fencing in lieu of wrought iron fencing at the first-floor private patios (as shown in the proposed elevations).

A discussion ensues among Commissioners, staff and the speaker concerning:

- Enhancing the landscaping in the parking lot area along Broadway
- Continuing the use of stone from the exterior entry to the pillars and corners of the buildings
- Upgrading the children's play area

Ginny MCLAUGHLIN, 1365 Broadway, Apt. 22, El Cajon, CA, is a resident at the subject property. She speaks in opposition to the project and expresses concern about financial hardships on tenants needing to relocate, and the effect that relocating has on children.

WELLS encourages the speaker to express her concerns to the City Council as well, and suggests MCLAUGHLIN check the City's website for information on home buying programs.

No one else comes forward to be heard.

Motion by BLACK, second by AMBROSE, to close the public hearing; carries 5-0.

A discussion ensues among Commissioners and staff concerning fencing materials.

Motion by AMBROSE, second by BLACK, to RECOMMEND APPROVAL of Planned Unit Development 296, adding language to condition 4.f to read "... TSM site plans, and shall include enhanced landscaping in and around the parking lot area."; carries 5-0.

Motion by AMBROSE, second by BLACK, to RECOMMEND APPROVAL of Tentative Subdivision Map 610 in accordance with the staff report; carries 5-0.

PLANNED UNIT DEVELOPMENT 297 – Westone Management Consultants for A.R.T. Properties "C" LLC

(public hearing) Resolution No. 10224
(joint noticed CC mtg 11-29-05)
(P.C. mtg. 10/24/05)

The subject property is located on the south side of E. Washington Avenue between S. Anza Street and Washington Heights Road, and addressed as 1121 E. Washington Avenue; APN: 493-112-07; General Plan Designation: Medium Density Residential.

Request to convert an existing 24-unit apartment complex into a common interest development in the R-3 (Multiple Family) zone.

AND

TENTATIVE SUBDIVISION MAP 611 - Westone Management Consultants for A.R.T. Properties "C" LLC

(public hearing) Resolution No. 10224
(joint noticed CC mtg 11-29-05)
(P.C. mtg. 10/24/05)

Request a one-lot subdivision map in the R-3 (Multiple Family) zone.

ALVEY provides an overview of the project and the proposed exterior enhancements. He comments on a condition of approval to reduce the retaining wall adjacent to the sidewalk on the westerly property line, in order to provide drivers with greater visibility and to provide a safer pedestrian environment. Staff also recommends the addition of a condition 3.f), which addresses the integrity of the roof and its remaining useful life.

ALVEY says that staff recommends that the Planning Commission recommend approval of Planned Unit Development 297 and Tentative Subdivision Map 611 subject to the conditions and for the reasons stated in the staff reports.

TURNER-EMERSON opens the public hearings.

Joseph SCARLATTI, Westone Management Consultants, 8799 Balboa Avenue, Suite 240, San Diego, CA, is the applicant's representative. He requests that proposed condition 3.f specify a 10-year roof life expectancy (rather than 15 years), and that condition 6.a)14 specify replacement of dryers only, as the washers were purchased approximately nine months ago.

A discussion ensues among Commissioners, staff and the speaker concerning:

- The possibility of replacing the flat roof with a pitched roof
- Insulation requirements
- Accepting proof of purchase date for newer laundry room appliance in lieu of replacement.

No one else comes forward to be heard.

Motion by WOODS, second by WELLS, to close the public hearing; carries 5-0.

RAMIREZ commends the applicant and his design team for working with staff in order to bring this project forward to the Commission.

Motion by BLACK, second by AMBROSE, to RECOMMEND APPROVAL of Planned Unit Development 297, adding a new condition 3.f. to read: "Provide an inspection report from a licensed contractor or engineer that evaluates the current condition of the roof and makes a recommendation on its status and then obtain the necessary permits for the roof; should the remaining useful life of the roof be 10 years or less, all buildings shall be re-roofed." carries 5-0.

Motion by BLACK, second by AMBROSE, to RECOMMEND APPROVAL of Tentative Subdivision Map 611 in accordance with the staff report; carries 5-0.

PREDRAFTED RESOLUTIONS

To reflect the actions of the Planning Commission on tonight's agenda items.

Motion by WOODS, second by AMBROSE, to adopt Resolution Nos. 10208, 10211, 10212 and 10218 - 10225 pro forma; carries 5-0.

ORAL COMMUNICATIONS

AMBROSE requests a future discussion item concerning a possible requirement for pitched roofs for condo conversions.

CORRESPONDENCE

There was none.

ADJOURNMENT

Motion by AMBROSE, second by WELLS, to adjourn the meeting of the El Cajon City Planning Commission at 9:22 PM this 24th day of October 2005.

Debra TURNER-EMERSON, Chair

ATTEST:

James S. GRIFFIN, Secretary